# WHITE PAPER

# **Motivation Matters:**

Career Challenges Broaden Participation in High-Skills Coursework, like STEM, and in High-Opportunity Careers

Jane Kubasik Founder & President, 114th Partnership

Laura Paxton Hassner Director of Innovation, 114th Partnership



# Contents

3	About the Authors
4	Narrowing the Opportunity Gap
5	Motivation Matters
7	The Power of Occupational Identity
8	Connecting Academics to Meaningful Careers
11	Effective Partnerships Pave the Way
12	Summary
13	114th Partnership High-Skills Solutions
14	References



### About the Authors

#### Jane Kubasik

Founder & President, 114th Partnership

With a background in business and finance, Jane has since dedicated nearly 15 years to developing smart employer-education partnerships that help young people connect their education to personally rewarding, viable career choices.

Since 2001, Jane has led multiple national and regional educator-employer collaborations designed to connect classroom learning to promising careers. These cross-sector alliances are grounded in research, utilize collaborative designs, and embed evaluations for evidenced-based performance management. Jane has led multiple cross-sector projects that deliver progress in student understanding, interest, identity development, and skills critical to career success, with a special focus on STEM.

Her groundbreaking approach to forging productive partnerships and alliances is featured in numerous education and business publications, including a 2009 Harvard Business School case study, "Leading for Equity", and a 2014 University of Phoenix report, "Investment Criteria for STEM Education: What Counts for Excellence in STEM Programs?" Jane is also the co-author of a 2011 Aspen Institute paper, "Why One Size Does Not Fit All: Strategic Spending and Collaboration for College and Career Readiness". She has been a featured presenter at events aiming to inspire progress with fresh insights as to what works in effective partnerships for student motivation.

#### Laura Paxton Hassner Director of Innovation, 114th Partnership

Laura joined the 114th Partnership in 2011 to leverage her expertise in corporate turnarounds and change management to improve the strategic collaboration between educators and employers.

In her role as Director of Innovation, Laura ensures that research, market, and field-based insights relevant to educator and employer cross-sector collaboration inform impactful program designs and continuous improvements. By integrating cutting-edge research into all aspects of the organization, she works to deepen the 114th's brand and expand its impact. Her efforts safeguard 114th Partnership program and service quality and affordability as the organization expands to new markets and users.

Laura is currently also pursuing an executive MBA from the Haas School of Business at the University of California, Berkeley. Laura applies her classroom learnings in real-time, by designing and customizing the case study process to the unique needs of learners in secondary, post-secondary, workforce development, and employment settings. These short, structured career challenges enable instructors to bring real-world examples of on-the-job tasks drawn from high-opportunity careers directly to their learners.



CONNECT. SPARK. EMPOWER

"Many job openings are not being filled because not enough applicants possess the high skills needed."



To broaden participation in high-opportunity careers, this paper proposes strengthening Career and Technical Education programs and integrating career-based problem solving into academic courses. Personal interest and experience are primary motivators to engagement in challenging coursework and demanding careers. More employer-educator partnerships should support the occupational identity development inherent in young people as a means to leverage career aspirations to influence secondary and post-secondary coursetaking outcomes.

### Narrowing the Opportunity Gap

Years of effort to recruit talent for high-demand careers has led to very little change.<sup>1,2</sup> Too few adults are employed in high-opportunity careers,<sup>3,4</sup> those which are well-paid, generally offer benefits,<sup>5</sup> and match an employee's talents and skills.<sup>6</sup> A staggering 42 percent of adults earn less than \$15 per hour, with more than 54 percent of Blacks/African Americans and almost 60 percent of Hispanics/Latinos trapped in jobs that barely cover their cost of living.<sup>7,8,9</sup>

Nearly all of today's "good" jobs require that employees possess high skills.<sup>10</sup> More than 70 percent of these jobs—including those not formally considered STEM<sup>11</sup> jobs<sup>12</sup>—require STEM and communications skills<sup>13</sup> such as technology use, quantitative reasoning, and problem-solving.<sup>14</sup>

A well-documented skills gap<sup>15</sup>—and resulting talent shortage —shows that many job openings are not being filled because not enough applicants possess the high skills needed.<sup>16</sup> STEM jobs are growing at a rate of three times that of non-STEM jobs with an estimated 2.4 million STEM jobs unfilled by 2018.<sup>17,18,19</sup> Further, despite a sustained effort to increase student participation in STEM fields, with a particular emphasis placed on underrepresented students, our nation's STEM workforce is no more diverse today than it was fifteen years ago.<sup>20</sup> Diversity matters, as research from a recent McKinsey & Company report found that diverse companies are 35 percent more likely to outperform their industry.<sup>21</sup>

Employers, educators, and young people themselves largely agree that secondary and post-secondary graduates are underprepared<sup>22,23,24,25,26</sup> and often unable to apply their knowledge to real-world settings.<sup>27</sup> And, too few students enroll and persist in the high-skills post-secondary<sup>28</sup> programs like mathematics, computer science, engineering, business, and healthcare that are needed to prepare for high-opportunity careers.<sup>29,30,31,32</sup> This stems from the fact that not enough students complete the foundational high-skills coursework in high school<sup>33</sup> - such as Algebra II,<sup>34</sup> advanced science, or certain elective courses - that incorporate the thinking skills<sup>35</sup> strongly correlated to high-opportunity jobs.<sup>36,37</sup>



"Too few solutions target *why* young people today do not pursue the coursework they need to develop high skills and secure rewarding jobs."



### **Motivation Matters**

Current solutions to narrow the opportunity gap over-emphasize economics – like high salaries for workers or lost revenue for employers. Too few solutions target *why* young people today do not pursue the coursework they need to develop high skills and secure rewarding jobs.<sup>38</sup> Research demonstrates that young people must be able to relate what they are learning to their own backgrounds.<sup>39</sup>

To be motivated to pursue a career, students must be informed about the career and knowledgeable about the pathway needed to prepare them for that career. Underrepresented students are less likely to amass the social capital<sup>40,41</sup> of family networks, formal and informal mentorships, and access to insider knowledge associated with today's good jobs.<sup>42,43</sup> Data on immigrant Hispanic/Latino students, whose families often have low levels of formal schooling, suggest that they may be particularly unaware of how high-skills coursework connects to their future career aspirations, especially in mathematics.<sup>44</sup> Underrepresented adolescent girls often lack adequate academic and career-oriented information, choose not to pursue STEM subjects, or are actively discouraged from taking the coursework that prepares them for STEM careers.<sup>45</sup>

Lacking social capital, learners are often forced to navigate post-secondary choices and career options alone, often without the benefit of counseling or other supports.<sup>46,47</sup> Without clarity on their future career goals, students have difficulty deciding what to study or how to progress towards degree completion. As a result, they are less likely to persevere, with only 36 percent of first-time community college students earning a post-secondary credential within a six-year period.<sup>48</sup>

TAKEAWAY #1: Evidence continues to mount that personal interest and experience are primary motivators to engagement in challenging coursework and demanding careers.



"Jobs in high-growth, high-opportunity careers must be tied to a meaningful purpose to help motivate students to complete high-skills coursework."



#### **Purpose-Driven Careers**

Tying jobs in high-growth, high-opportunity careers to a meaningful purpose helps motivate students to complete high-skills coursework. Today's young people seek careers that meet personal and social as well as professional goals.<sup>49</sup> 60 percent of millennials actively screen potential employers for a sense of purpose and social responsibility.<sup>50</sup> And, digital-native Gen Z-ers, most of whom are currently enrolled in K-12 schools, are even more globally-oriented<sup>51</sup> than their millennial predecessors, "determined to take charge of their future and also primed to create solutions."<sup>52</sup> Companies are paying attention, expanding traditional measures of profit, return on investment, and shareholder value to include environmental and social dimensions.<sup>53</sup>

Purpose-driven jobs will soon be amongst the fastest growing occupations.<sup>54</sup> Studies show young people from traditionally underserved populations demonstrate heightened preferences for degrees and jobs with explicit social benefits – like social work.<sup>55,56,57,58</sup> 70 percent of college students come from underrepresented populations or are women, yet they hold less than 45 percent of STEM degrees.<sup>59</sup>

#### Task Relevance

Educational psychologists posit that self-efficacy<sup>60</sup> (the belief that one can do the work) and a growth mindset<sup>61</sup> (the belief that intelligence is like a muscle to be developed) are important factors in student success. Too little attention, however, has been paid to compelling research on students' perceptions of task relevance (the *desire* to do the work)—although studies show it is a major determinant of whether students choose to enroll in high-skills courses later in their educational pursuits.<sup>62,63,64</sup>

Students benefit from opportunities to connect their schoolwork with their short- and long-term personal goals.<sup>65</sup> Surveys continue to emphasize that students are disengaged, particularly in high school.<sup>66</sup> Students report that they do not see how what they are learning in the classroom connects to their lives, a fact that one study directly links to a primary reason that students drop out.<sup>67</sup> Educators are challenged to keep students engaged in ways that meet their developmental needs with "activities that take them out of their comfort zones, challenge them, place them among adult workers in authentic settings, and ask them to perform."<sup>68</sup>

TAKEAWAY #2: Adapting the graduate school "case study" methodology (i.e. "career challenges") to forge explicit connections between course objectives and meaningful career problem-solving scenarios shows promise.



"To support students as they form their occupational identity, employers and educators must seek ways to connect learning to the interests, motivations, and humanitarian aspirations of today's young people."



# The Power of Occupational Identity

*Occupational identity,* the relationship one develops between self-image and one's career, forms during adolescence,<sup>69</sup> a period that begins during puberty and continues well into the twenties.<sup>70</sup> Young people, are actively forming their self-image—who they are, what they care about, and what their ultimate place in the world will be.<sup>71,72</sup> They seek occupations that interest them and offer the possibility of success.<sup>73</sup> Over two-thirds of secondary students indicate that the greatest influences on their career plans are their own interests and experiences—greater than the influence of parents, teachers, or social media.<sup>74,75</sup> Adolescents who progress in shaping their occupational identities<sup>76</sup> and who connect their educational pursuits with career goals are much more likely to persist in high-skills coursework<sup>77</sup> and obtain post-secondary credentials.<sup>78,79</sup> Furthermore, research demonstrates that: "establishing a strong, self-chosen, positive, and flexible occupational identity appears to be an important contributor to occupational success, social adaptation, and psychological well-being."<sup>80</sup>

Adolescents from families with low educational attainment tend to not make the explicit connection between their educational choices and their career aspirations.<sup>81</sup> Thus, it becomes all the more critical to serve those young people who lack this support network. Increased goal clarity also makes those aged 14 through 30 less prone to depression and unproductive behavior.<sup>82</sup>

Traditionally, occupational identity was developed through part-time jobs that offered young people valuable work experience,<sup>83</sup> exposure to career options, and opportunities to experiment with different careers.<sup>84</sup> Most of today's adolescents, however, have little access to work,<sup>85</sup> and they miss out on opportunities to connect what they are learning in school to the real world. Although teens may say they want to work,<sup>86</sup> fewer than ever hold part-time jobs. Those who do work predominately earn low wages for low-skills work,<sup>87</sup> with little opportunity for skill improvement. Teens now depend more heavily on school to provide early work experience, exposure to jobs, and career counseling, as well as the kind of learning that traditionally takes place at work rather than in the classroom.<sup>88</sup>

To support students as they form their occupational identity, employers and educators must seek ways to connect learning to the interests, motivations, and humanitarian aspirations of today's young people.

TAKEAWAY#3: Fewer young people than ever are employed and those who have jobs are not building skills.



"Too few secondary courses integrate academics with real-world problem solving."



# **Connecting Academics to Meaningful Careers**

### Real-World Problem Solving

Young people who can connect their desire for career experimentation to what they are learning in schools are more likely to engage in high-skills coursework, coursework that allows them to explore their talents and interests while weighing them against career possibilities.<sup>89,90</sup> Yet, too few secondary courses integrate high-skills courses with real-world problem solving so that students can apply academic learning to workplace challenges. In a recent survey, only 25 percent of educators felt that their existing school curriculum "adequately prepar[es] students for a STEM career".<sup>91</sup> Similarly, too few Career and Technical Education (CTE) programs infuse high-quality academics: "It is widely understood that the main point of CTE is to keep them motivated to stay through high school graduation, not to give them genuine preparation for and an initial experience of the workforce."<sup>92</sup> Newer models incorporating real-world problem solving that delivers results are eclipsing traditional CTE. CTE is starting to change, but academic courses often remain siloed from specific career applications.

Academically-focused CTE, such as linked learning, which fuses traditional academic learning with high-quality career-themed pathways, benefits students as they learn how their skills are used. Students participating in linked learning complete more coursework and have lower dropout rates and higher graduation rates than their non-participating peers. In the California State University system, these students go on to achieve higher overall GPAs, results that hold for female and Hispanic/Latino students.<sup>93</sup> It is important, however, that these programs emphasize mastery of high skills versus the traditional "vocational" training model focused on occupation-specific skill attainment. A peer-reviewed study in the *Journal of Human Resources* concluded that: "The advantages of vocational training in smoothing entry into the labor market have to be set against disadvantages later in life."<sup>94</sup> As the economy changes, this research suggests that vocationally-trained students lack the general skills they need to adapt to a changing labor market.<sup>95</sup>

Students struggle most in abstract coursework such as mathematics,<sup>96,97</sup> where they must anchor new information in prior knowledge or experience. Students with limited personal experience, or who come from environments low in social capital, are especially vulnerable if those connections are lacking.<sup>98</sup> Relating content to the cultural background of students "prompts student involvement" while the reverse causes "student resistance".<sup>99</sup>

Many educators recognize the importance of active learning,<sup>100</sup> understanding that adolescents need relevant explanations to make connections and develop interests.<sup>101</sup> Yet, educators often lack high-quality, accessible instructional resources<sup>102</sup> that go beyond traditional textbook and lecture-based instruction to support students in drawing connections across courses or in applying their classroom learnings to real-world challenges. As a result, instructors may have difficulty helping students apply academic skills to analyze, evaluate, create, and communicate solutions relevant to their career goals, although these processes are proven to capture and cultivate student interest.<sup>103,104</sup>



"To broaden engagement in the high-skills courses that lead to the most career opportunities, educators and employers must help students analyze, evaluate, create, and communicate solutions relevant to those careers."



Translating abstract learning into real-world career applications helps students both to master traditional material at a deeper level and to perceive learning as relevant and engaging,<sup>105</sup> a dynamic that influences their long-term occupational identity as well as their post-secondary goals. While 77 percent of high school students report wanting to simulate real-world scenarios, only 12 percent report having the opportunity to do so.<sup>106</sup> Workplace experience is important for boosting a post-secondary student's self-confidence as well: college students with paid or unpaid workplace experience are significantly more likely to feel prepared for the workplace after graduation.<sup>107</sup>

Often called deeper or problem-based learning, this instructional strategy integrates traditional content with creative applied problem-solving,<sup>108</sup> emphasizing *why* content matters.<sup>109</sup> It reduces educational disparities and provides adolescents with the skills to be successful in work and life.<sup>110</sup> By involving students and requiring that they interact with their own learning, students find that their interest is maintained.<sup>111</sup> Students are encouraged to understand multiple perspectives by applying and transferring their knowledge and skills to different scenarios,<sup>112,113</sup> pre-worked case studies,<sup>114</sup> examples, and problem sets. Initially, they receive scaffolding support and step-by-step modeling as they work through problem-solving exercises, with concepts clearly explained along the way.<sup>115</sup> They then proceed to a deeper level of understanding by applying their learning to scenarios with less structure,<sup>116</sup> such as ambiguous, classroom-based challenges or real-world opportunities like internships and employment.

As a result, students report being more engaged, indicating that the "inquirybased activities make the content easier to remember."<sup>117</sup> Engaged students have harnessed their internal motivation to pursue their goals.<sup>118</sup> Compared to traditionally-taught peers, these students scored higher on all metrics, including their ability to solve complex problems, work effectively in teams, communicate, and be able to learn and to make connections across disciplines and to the "real world".<sup>119</sup> Not surprisingly, linking content to real-world career applications benefits students who are most at risk of dropping out, leading to measurably improved attendance rates, academic course-taking, and on-time graduation rates.<sup>120</sup> Students participating in deeper learning graduated at an 8 percent higher rate than comparison peers, and were more likely to attend post-secondary institutions, that, in turn, were more selective, four-year degree granting institutions.<sup>121</sup>

To broaden engagement in the high-skills courses that lead to the most career opportunities, educators and employers must help students analyze, evaluate, create, and communicate solutions relevant to those careers. Classroom speakers, field trips, work-based learning opportunities, and Career and Technical Education<sup>122</sup> courses must integrate more high-skills problem-solving content in order to support the development of higher-order thinking skills. In the same way, high-skills courses must integrate more career applications. Both need effective, career-based resources to enhance the student motivation that precedes and accelerates learning.







Yet, expanding deeper learning to benefit all students, particularly underrepresented students, faces significant obstacles. Employers who offer career-learning opportunities lack standardized benchmarks for quality, and most do not have sufficient capacity to serve all students. Absent robust participation from area employers, teachers lack sufficient instructional resources to offer problem-based learning. And, educators in central offices require support for logistical implementation of work-based learning opportunities so that all students have access to them.<sup>123</sup>

TAKEAWAY#4: Employers and educators need high-quality and affordable alternatives to connect meaningful, high-growth career opportunities to the thinking, problem solving and communication skills taught in today's secondary and post-secondary education settings.

#### Scalable Solutions

Too few existing solutions, tied to student outcomes and integrating highskills academics with career applications, reach today's 16.3 million high school students.<sup>124,125</sup> Although 88 percent of employers feel that it is important that college students graduate with the knowledge and skills sufficient to "complete an applied learning project", only 14 percent of employers find new graduates capable of doing so.<sup>126</sup> Indeed, 74 percent of students surveyed by the Adecco Group, the world's largest professional staffing company, "felt that their schools failed to fully prepare them for the professional world."<sup>127</sup> Scaling requires that these solutions be highquality, broadly available, easy to adopt, and suitable for solving relevant problems.<sup>128</sup> Teachers benefit from support to integrate classroom learning with contemporary career applications.<sup>129,130</sup> Yet, many programs have limited availability due to high fiscal cost, equipment requirements, or time constraints facing teachers and central office support staff.<sup>131,132</sup>

Students especially need support as they complete required gateway academic courses and vet elective options like career and technical programs or advanced academic classes. Underrepresented populations in particular lack access to high-quality, affordable instructional resources. For example, only half of eighth-grade science teachers who teach Black/African-American students indicate they have all or most of the resources they need compared to 65 percent of those who teach white students. 67 percent of those who teach higher income students report having such resources, compared to only 56 percent of those who teach lower income students.<sup>133</sup>



"Employers play a key role in helping young people to identify personally relevant and viable career interests that link to high-skills coursework."





### **Effective Partnerships Pave the Way**

Effective employer-educator partnerships that produce high-quality and broadly available, affordable resources can help educators to engage their students as they master critical skills. Fusing classroom learning with real-world experience personalizes learning.<sup>134</sup> Infusing career experimentation into the gateway courses that reach most students, such as state-mandated math, science, technology, and English language arts, can give students a motivational lens through which to make informed choices about their ongoing education and future careers. It also provides an answer to students' desire for more career exploration opportunities.<sup>135</sup>

Most school leaders welcome employer input on curriculum and professional development because of its proven effectiveness.<sup>136,137</sup> Superintendents are increasingly seeking to change the historical patterns of engaging with employers,<sup>138</sup> stating that their highest priority was for businesses to "help them to understand how to develop in students the skills required to succeed in the workforce."<sup>139,140</sup>

While 70 percent of businesses are in partnership with schools in some way,<sup>141</sup> successful examples of scalable employer-educator partnerships are challenging to find. Pacific Gas and Electric Company's PowerPathway<sup>™</sup> initiative established a network of education programs focused on building capacity for skilled energy workers.<sup>142</sup> Other examples include schools whose teaching focuses on skills required for specific careers, like High Tech High Schools, Project Lead the Way, and Big Picture Schools or "early college high schools" whose thematic focus on STEM skills and partnering with employers provides opportunities for students to engage in on-the-job tasks.<sup>143</sup>

For employers to realize their goal of reducing talent shortages, students must graduate skilled *and* motivated. Employers play a key role in helping young people to identify personally relevant and viable career interests that link to high-skills coursework.

TAKEAWAY#5: To ensure high quality resources reach today's young people across educational settings, employers and educators should co-develop career challenges in formats that easily integrate into secondary and post-secondary courses and community volunteer events.



### Summary<sup>144</sup>

Between 2018 and 2022, an estimated 16.8 million students will graduate from our nation's high schools.<sup>145</sup> In order to successfully transition to post-secondary education and the workplace, students must be both prepared to meet the challenges they will encounter along their professional pathways, as well as inspired to overcome them.

Evidence continues to mount that personal interest and experience are primary motivators to engagement in challenging coursework and demanding careers. Employers and educators need high-quality and affordable alternatives to connect meaningful, high-growth career opportunities to the thinking, problem solving, and communication skills taught in today's secondary and post-secondary education settings. This is more important today than ever, as fewer young people are employed and those who have jobs are not building skills. Adapting the graduate school "case study" methodology (i.e. "career challenges") to forge explicit connections between course objectives and meaningful career problem solving scenarios shows promise. To ensure high quality resources reach today's young people across educational settings, employers and educators should co-develop career challenges in formats that easily integrate into secondary and post-secondary courses and community volunteer events.

The 114th Partnership helps employers and educators provide equitable, highquality opportunities for adolescent learners to access crucial information from employers and to apply what they are learning in the classroom to on-the-job tasks from high-opportunity careers. These experiences help unlock young people's intrinsic motivation, which subsequently drives course enrollment, course completion, and career pursuit.



"Three complementary partnership programs foster concrete connections between high-skills coursework and highopportunity careers."





# 114th Partnership High-Skills Solutions

Named for the meridian that bridges the Great Continental Divide, the 114<sup>th</sup> Partnership is a nonprofit intermediary organization that works with educators and employers to help young people navigate education and career pathways.

Three complementary partnership programs foster concrete connections between high-skills coursework and high-opportunity careers. Each researchbased program, co-developed with educators and employers, articulates mutually valued outcomes and features easy-to-implement designs.

The 114<sup>th</sup> Partnership prioritizes program implementation in predominately underrepresented student populations, particularly Black/African American and Hispanic/Latino. Grant-funded community projects serve populations with 65 percent or more traditionally underrepresented students.

Spark 101 STEM Skills Videos equip professional educators to integrate course objectives with on-the-job tasks from high-opportunity careers. These tenminute interactive videos, co-developed with employers, are the only free resource of their kind. Students apply academic skills to analyze, evaluate, create, and communicate their solutions to the featured employer challenges. Educators are supported with usage guides and customizable lesson plans.

114th Professional Challenges equip employee volunteers to shape students' career interests with real workplace scenarios. Live challenges provide handson coaching and mentoring as an alternative to traditional presentations and internships. Challenges feature on-the-job tasks drawn from high-opportunity careers and are offered in 1-, 4- and 20-hour formats. Volunteers are supported by customized, ready-to-use materials for use in the workplace, in the classroom, or online.

Accelerated Impact helps communities engage educators and employers to motivate their young people to pursue high-skills coursework tied to regionally relevant high-opportunity careers. Serving as a specialized intermediary, the program helps educators, employers, and other aligned nonprofit partners to strengthen outcomes in motivation, course enrollment, post-secondary credentials, and employment.

We are well on our way to enlisting 500 employers and 30,000 educators to inspire at least 1,000,000 secondary students to acquire the skills to pursue personally meaningful, high-opportunity careers.



#### References

- <sup>1</sup> Gillespie, Patrick. "America's Persistent Problem: Unskilled Workers, CNN Money, http://money. cnn.com/2015/08/07/news/economy/us-economy-job-skills-gap/, 7 August 2015.
- <sup>2</sup> Lumina Foundation and Gallup Inc. "What America Needs to Know About Higher Education Redesign," 25 February 2014, p. 25.
- <sup>3</sup> The loss of GDP during the 2007-9 "Great Recession" was double that of the prior ten recessions, but the subsequent recovery was only half as much, meaning that many "prime age" workers remain out of work. As of 2015, the labor-force participation rate for all workers remained 3 percentage points below pre-2007 levels. For more detailed information see: Carnevale, A. P., Jayasundera, T., & Gulish, A. (2015). Good Jobs Are Back: College Graduates Are First in Line (Rep.). Retrieved from https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/Good-Jobs\_Full\_Final. pdf. Page 4, Quoting: Yellen, "A Painfully Slow Recovery for American Workers," 2013 and Pitts, Robertson, and Terry, "Reasons for the Decline in Prime Age Labor Force Participation," 2014.
- <sup>4</sup> 39 percent of US employers report: "difficulty filling jobs due to lack of available talent". See: Bessen, James. "Employers Aren't Just Whining – the "Skills Gap" Is Real," *Harvard Business Review*, https://hbr.org/2014/08/employers-arent-just-whining-the-skills-gap-is-real, 25 August 2014. The author argues that the "skills gap" is not new—it was also reported prior to the 2007 recession. Bessen demonstrates that sustained wage growth for highly skilled workers implies persistent skill shortages. See also: Manpower Group. "2015 Talent Shortage Survey Research Results." http://www.manpowergroup.com/wps/wcm/connect/408f7067-ba9c-4c98-b0ec-dca74403a802/2015\_Talent\_Shortage\_Survey-lo\_res.pdf?MOD=AJPERES&ContentCache=NO NE, 2015, p. 7.
- <sup>5</sup> Carnevale, A. P., Jayasundera, T., & Gulish, A. (2015). Good Jobs Are Back: College Graduates Are First in Line (Rep.). Retrieved from https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/Good-Jobs\_Full\_Final.pdf. Page 4.
- <sup>6</sup> Gallup and Lumina Foundation. "What America Needs to Know About Higher Education Redesign," http://www.gallup.com/services/176759/america-needs-know-higher-educationredesign.aspx, 2014, p. 5.
- <sup>7</sup> Zillman, Claire, "Who makes less than \$15 per hour? An Explainer in 3 Charts", Fortune, 13 April 2015. http://fortune.com/2015/04/13/who-makes-15-per-hour/.
- <sup>8</sup> Tung, I., Lathrop, Y., & P. Sonn. "The Growing Movement for \$15," National Employment Law Project, www.nelp.org/content/uploads/Growing-Movement-for-15-Dollars.pdf, 2015, p. 1.
- <sup>9</sup> We are borrowing here the terminology utilized by the Center on Education and the Workforce at Georgetown University. The authors thank Senior Analyst Andrew Hanson for his clarification on this point.
- <sup>10</sup> Adams, Susan. "The 10 Skills Employers Most Want in 20-Something Employees," Forbes, http://www.forbes.com/sites/susanadams/2013/10/11/the-10-skills-employers-most-want-in-20-something-employees/#1633c122752d, 11 October 2013. See also: Adams, Susan. "The 10 Skills Employers Most Want In 2015 Graduates," Forbes, http://www.forbes.com/sites/ susanadams/2014/11/12/the-10-skills-employers-most-want-in-2015-graduates/#73c8c95e19f6, 12 November 2014.
- <sup>11</sup> Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics.
- <sup>12</sup> Elrod, S. "Quantitative Reasoning: The Next "Across the Curriculum," Association of American Colleges and Universities, 16(3), https://www.aacu.org/peerreview/2014/summer/elrod Movement, 2014.
- <sup>13</sup> Langdon, D., McKittrick, G., Beede, D., Khan, B., & Doms, M. "Good jobs now and for the future," *ESA Issue Brief 03-11*, Washington, DC: US Department of Commerce. Quoted in: 114th Partnership and Keller, Clare E., "Using STEM Case Studies to Prepare Today's Students for Tomorrow's Jobs: An Evaluation of Spark 101," February 2016, p. 22.
- <sup>14</sup> Carnevale, A. P., Smith, N., & Strohl, J, "Recovery: Job Growth and Education Requirements Through 2020," cew.georgetown.edu/recovery2020, June 2013, p. 2.
- <sup>15</sup> Manpower Group. "2015 Talent Shortage Survey Research Results," http://www.manpowergroup. com/wps/wcm/connect/408f7067-ba9c-4c98-b0ec-dca74403a802/2015\_Talent\_Shortage\_ Survey-lo\_res.pdf?MOD=AJPERES&ContentCache=NONE, 2015, p 7.



CONNECT. SPARK. EMPOWER

- <sup>16</sup> Gillespie, Patrick. "America's Persistent Problem: Unskilled Workers," CNN Money, http://money. cnn.com/2015/08/07/news/economy/us-economy-job-skills-gap/, 7 August 2015.
- <sup>17</sup> The White House. "STEM Depiction Opportunities". https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/ files/microsites/ostp/imageofstemdepictiondoc\_02102016\_clean.pdf, 10 February 2016.
- <sup>18</sup> This is the case for over two million jobs in the manufacturing sector alone, See: Deloitte. "The skills gap in U.S. manufacturing 2015 and beyond," Deloitte and Manufacturing Institute, http://www2.deloitte.com/us/en/pages/manufacturing/articles/boiling-point-the-skills-gap-in-us-manufacturing.html, 2015, p. 2.
- <sup>19</sup> Donachie, Pat. "Survey shows room for STEM ed improvement," EducationDIVE, http://www. educationdive.com/news/survey-shows-room-for-stem-ed-improvement/444299/, 6 June 2017.
- <sup>20</sup> Bidwell, Allie. "STEM Workforce No More Diverse Than 14 Years Ago," US News & World Report, http://www.usnews.com/news/stem-solutions/articles/2015/02/24/stem-workforce-no-morediverse-than-14-years-ago, 24 February 2016. This article references data from Change the Equation, www.changetheequation.org.
- <sup>21</sup> Hunt, Vivian, Dennis Layton and Sara Prince. "Why Diversity Matters", McKinsey. June 2015.
- <sup>22</sup> Hart Research Associates. "Falling Short? College Learning and Career Success," https://www. aacu.org/sites/default/files/files/LEAP/2015employerstudentsurvey.pdf, 2015, pp. 6, 12.
- <sup>23</sup> Schaffhauser, Dian. "Survey: Professors and Employers Find High School Grads Unready for College or Work," *The Journal*, https://thejournal.com/articles/2015/07/27/survey-most-profsfind-hs-grads-unready-for-college-or-work.aspx, 27 July 2015.
- <sup>24</sup> Weathers, Lucia Anderson. "Today's Business Leaders Say, 'It's What You Know, Not Where You Go' When Making Hiring Decisions, New Study Shows," Lumina Foundation, https:// www.luminafoundation.org/news-and-events/today-s-business-leaders-say-it-s-what-youknow-not-where-you-go-when-making-hiring-decisions-new-study-shows, Cited in: "Talent Orchestrators: Scaling Youth Employment Through Business-Facing Intermediaries," US Chamber of Commerce Foundation, 2016. You can access the original Lumina/Gallup study, *What America Needs to Know about Higher Education Redesign* at: https://www.luminafoundation.org/files/ resources/2013-gallup-lumina-foundation-report.pdf.
- <sup>25</sup> The National Center for Public Policy and Higher Education. "Beyond the Rhetoric Improving College Readiness Through Coherent State Policy," http://www.highereducation.org/reports/ college\_readiness/gap.shtml, 2010.
- <sup>26</sup> Musto, Pete. "US College Students Feel Unprepared for the 'Real World'," VOA, http://www. voanews.com/a/us-college-students-feel-unprepared-for-real-world/3539712.html, 6 October 2016.
- <sup>27</sup> Hart Associates. "Falling Short? College Learning and Career Success (Rep.)," https://www.aacu. org/sites/default/files/IEAP/2015employerstudentsurvey.pdf, 2015, p. 6.
- <sup>28</sup> Post-secondary education refers to any type of education beyond high school and includes both certificated vocational training and college and university offering a degree or academic certificate.
- <sup>29</sup> College Ready. (n.d.), http://www.redefiningready.org/college-ready.
- <sup>30</sup> Carnevale, Anthony P., Andrea Porter, Jennifer Landis-Santos. "Hispanics: College Majors and Earnings," Center on Education and the Workforce, Georgetown University, 2015, https://cew. georgetown.edu/cew-reports/hispanicmajors/, p. 3.
- <sup>31</sup> Carnevale, A. P., Fasules, M. L., Porter, A., & Landis-Santos. "African American College Majors and Earning (Rep.)," https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/ AfricanAmericanMajors\_2016\_web.pdf, 2016.
- <sup>32</sup> Walker, Erica N., "Why Aren't More Minorities Taking Advanced Math?," November 2007, p. 1.
- <sup>33</sup> Carnevale, A. P., Jayasundera, T., & Gulish, A. "America's Divided Recovery: College Haves and Have-Nots (Rep.)," https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/Americas-Divided-Recovery-web.pdf, 2016, pp. 3-4.
- <sup>34</sup> COLLEGE READY. (n.d.), http://www.redefiningready.org/college-ready.



- <sup>35</sup> Gottfried, Michael A. "The Influence of Applied STEM Coursetaking on Advanced Mathematics and Science Coursetaking," May 19, 2015, p. 3.
- <sup>36</sup> Falco, Lia D.. "The School Counselor and STEM Career Development," *Journal of Career Development*, 2016, p. 2.
- <sup>37</sup> "The Condition of STEM, ACT and National, www.act.org/stemcondition, 2015, p. 3.
- <sup>38</sup> Fleming, John H. and James K. Harter. "The Next Discipline: Applying Behavioral Economics to Drive Growth and Profitability," Gallup, Inc., http://www.gallup.com/services/178028/nextdiscipline-pdf.aspx, 2013, p. 2.
- <sup>39</sup> Wlodkowski, Raymond, J. and Margery B. Ginsberg, "A Framework for Culturally Responsive Teaching", *Educational Leadership*, Strengthening Student Engagement: Vol. 53, No. 1, pp. 17-21.
- <sup>40</sup> Rios-Aguilar, Cecilia and Regina Deil-Amen. "Beyond Getting In and Fitting In: An Examination of Social Networks and Professionally Relevant Social Capital Among Latina/o University Students," Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, Sage Publishing 11(2), 2012, p. 179.
- <sup>41</sup> Seibert, Scott E., Maria L. Kraimer and Robert C. Liden. "A Social Capital Theory of Career Success," *Academy of Management Journal*, 2001, Volume 44, No. 2, p. 219.
- <sup>42</sup> Wimberly, G. L., & Noeth, R. J. "College Readiness Begins in Middle School (Rep.)," http://www. cccrusader.org/College Readiness Begins in Middle School by George Wimberly.pdf, 2005, pp. 1-4.
- <sup>43</sup> Wimberly and Noeth., p. 4.
- <sup>44</sup> Lopez, Edward M. "Guidance of Latino High School Students in Mathematics and Career Identity Development," May 2001, p. 205.
- <sup>45</sup> Jeanne, Weiler. "Career Development for African American and Latina Females," *ERIC/CUE Digest*, Number 125, http://www.ericdigests.org/1998-1/career.htm, August 1997.
- <sup>46</sup> Carnevale, A. P., Smith, N., Melton, M., & Price, E. W. "Learning While Earning: The New Normal (Rep.)," https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/Working-Learners-Report.pdf, 2015, p. 12.
- <sup>47</sup> Rios-Aguilar and Deil-Amen, p. 192.
- <sup>48</sup> Jenkins, Davis and Sung-Woo Cho. "Get With the Program: Accelerating Community College Students' Entry into and Completion of Programs of Study," *Community College Research Center*, Teachers College, Columbia University, January 2012 (Originally released April 2011), https://ccrc. tc.columbia.edu/media/k2/attachments/accelerating-student-entry-completion.pdf, p. 1. The authors quote a study by: Radford, A. W., Berkner, L., Wheeless, S. C., & Shepherd. "Persistence and attainment of 2003–04 beginning postsecondary students: After 6 years". (NCES 2011-151). Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Statistics, 2010.
- <sup>49</sup> Deloitte. "Helping Purpose Driven Talent Thrive," DTTL Global Brand and Communications, http:// www2.deloitte.com/content/dam/Deloitte/global/Documents/About-Deloitte/gx-gr15-purposedriven-talent-thrive.pdf, 2015, p. 1.
- <sup>50</sup> Center for UC Berkeley Executive Education. "CSR is a High-Impact Business Strategy," 4 May 2016, http://executive.berkeley.edu/thought-leadership/blog/csr-high-impact-business-strategy.
- <sup>51</sup> Dill, Katherine. "7 Things Employers Should Know about the Gen Z Workforce," Forbes, http:// www.forbes.com/sites/kathryndill/2015/11/06/7-things-employers-should-know-about-the-gen-zworkforce/#6903f0802188, 6 November 2015.
- <sup>52</sup> The Center for Generational Kinetics. "New Study Reveals Gen Z Doesn't Want to End Up Like Millennials," http://genhq.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/Gen-Z---s-political-and-civicoutlook-press-release-2-17-16-c-2016-The-Center-for-Generational-Kinetics.pdf, February 2016.
- <sup>53</sup> This is known as the "triple bottom line", See: Center for UC Berkeley Executive Education.
- <sup>54</sup> Carnevale, Smith, and Strohl, p. 2.
- <sup>55</sup> Carnevale, Porter, and Landis-Santos, p. 3.



- <sup>56</sup> Landivar, Christin Liana. "Disparities in STEM Employment by Sex, Race, and Hispanic Origin," *American Community Survey Reports*, United States Census Bureau, https://www.census.gov/ prod/2013pubs/acs-24.pdf, September 2013, p. 1.
- <sup>57</sup> Carnevale, A. P., Fasules, M. L., Porter, A., & Landis-Santos, J, "African American College Majors and Earning," https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/AfricanAmericanMajors\_2016\_ web.pdf, 2016.
- <sup>58</sup> Carnevale, Porter, and Landis-Santos, p. 3.
- <sup>59</sup> The White House.
- <sup>60</sup> Bandura, A. "Self-efficacy," 1994), in V. S. Ramachaudran (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Human Behavior*, Vol. 4, New York: Academic Press, pp. 71-81. (Reprinted in H. Friedman [Ed.], *Encyclopedia of Mental Health*, San Diego: Academic Press, 1998.) Available at: https://www.uky.edu/~eushe2/ Bandura/BanEncy.html.
- <sup>61</sup> Dweck, Carol. "Carol Dweck Revisits the 'Growth Mindset'," *Education Week*, http://www. edweek.org/ew/articles/2015/09/23/carol-dweck-revisits-the-growth-mindset.html, 22 September 2015.
- 62 Falco, p. 3.
- 63 Falco, p. 5.
- <sup>64</sup> Falco, p. 2.
- <sup>65</sup> "Interest motivation" is a critical tool for students who feel "alienated" from subjects such as mathematics and science. See, for example: Michelsen, Claus and Bharath Sriraman. "Does interdisciplinary instruction raise students' interest in mathematics and the subjects of the natural sciences?" *ZDM*, January 2009, Volume 41, Issue 1, http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/ s11858-008-0161-5, p. 243.
- <sup>66</sup> Gallup's 2015 Student Engagement Poll found that only half of the one million students surveyed feel engaged in high school. Gallup Student Poll 2015 Results. http://www.gallup.com/ services/189926/student-poll-2015-results.aspx#.
- <sup>67</sup> Bridgeland, John M., John J. Dilulio, Jr., Karen Burke Morison. "The Silent Epidemic: Perspectives of High School Dropouts," Civic Enterprises in association with Peter D. Hart Research Associates for the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, https://docs.gatesfoundation.org/Documents/ TheSilentEpidemic3-06Final.pdf, March 2006, p. iv.
- <sup>68</sup> Hoffman, p. 7. Quoting: Robert Halpern, Chair of the Research Council at Erikson Institute. For more information, see: Halpern, R. 2013. Youth, Education, and the Role of Society: Rethinking Learning in the High School Years. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press.
- <sup>69</sup> Malanchuk, Oksana, Emily E. Messersmith and Jacquelynne S. Eccles. "The Ontogeny of Career Identities in Adolescence", New Dir Child Adolesc Dev. 2010 Winter; 2010(130): 97–110.
- <sup>70</sup> For a discussion of how longitudinal neuroimaging studies show that the adolescent brain continues to develop, See: Johnson, Sara B., Robert W. Blum and Jay N. Geidd. "Adolescent Maturity and the Brain: The Promise and Pitfalls of Neuroscience Research in Adolescent Health Policy", US National Library of Medicine, National Institutes of Health, J Adolesc Health. 2009 Sep; 45(3): 216–221.
- <sup>71</sup> E. Anne Marshall, Francis L. Guenette, Tanya Ward, Tara Morley, Breanna Lawrence, and Kate Fisher. "Adolescents' Science Career Aspirations Explored Through Identity and Possible Selves," *Pacific CRYSTAL Centre for Science, Mathematics, and Technology Literacy: Lessons Learned Adolescents' Science Career Aspirations Explored Through Identity and Possible Selves,* SensePublishers, 2011, pp. 47-65.
- <sup>72</sup> See: Luyckx, Koen, Theo A. Klimstra, Bart Duriez, Stijn Van Petegem and Wim Beyers. "Personal Identity Processes from Adolescence Through the Late 20s: Age Trends, Functionality, and Depressive Symptoms," November 2013 p 716, Also referencing: Erikson, 1968.



- <sup>73</sup> See: Gottfredson, L. S., "Using Gottfredson's theory of circumscription and compromise in career guidance and counseling" in S. D. Brown & R. W. Lent (Eds.), *Career Development and Counseling: Putting Theory and Research to Work*, pp. 71-100. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, 2004. And: Tang, M., Pan, W., & Newmeyer, M, "Factors Influencing High School Students' Career Aspirations," *Professional School Counseling*, 11(5), 2008, 285-295. And: Aschbacher, P. R., Li, E., & Roth, E. J. "Is science me? High school students' identities, participation and aspirations in science, engineering, and medicine," *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 47(5), 2010, 564-582, quoted in: 114th Partnership and Clare E. Keller. "Using STEM Case Studies to Prepare Today's Students for Tomorrow's Jobs: An Evaluation of Spark 101," February 2016, p. 20.
- <sup>74</sup> The Manufacturing Institute, Skills USA, and the Educational Research Center of America. "Attracting the Next Generation Workforce: The Role of Career and Technical Education," The Manufacturing Institute. http://www.themanufacturinginstitute.org/~/media/313BCA4C3721444C A8C48F7304F32027.ashx, October 2015, p. 3.
- <sup>75</sup> Henrikse, Karoline Ellen, Justin Dillon, and Jim Ryder, Editors. Understanding Student Participation and Choice in Science and Technology Education, Springer Netherlands, 2015. p. 368.
- <sup>76</sup> Adolescents tend to use educational goals to inform career choice. Those who had higher educational goals also had increased occupational aspirations. See: Beal, Sarah J. and Lisa J. Crockett. "Adolescents' occupational and educational goals: A test of reciprocal relations," *Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology* 34, http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j. appdev.2013.04.005, 2013, pp. 219–229.
- <sup>77</sup> Perez, Tony, Jennifer G. Cromley and Avi Kaplan. "The Role of Identity Development, Value, and Costs in College STEM Retention," *Journal of Education Psychology*. August 2013, p. 2.
- <sup>78</sup> Gallup, Inc. "Gallup Student Poll Engaged Today Ready for Tomorrow," Gallup, Inc. http://www.gallup.com/services/189926/student-poll-2015-results.aspx, 2015, p. 12.
- <sup>79</sup> Fleming and Harter, Page 2.
- <sup>80</sup> Skorikov, Vladimir B. and Fred W. Vondracek. "Occupational Identity". *Handbook of Identity Theory and Research*, Springer, 09 February 2011, pp. 693.
- <sup>81</sup> Beal and Crockett, p. 219.
- <sup>82</sup> Luyckx, Koen, Theo A. Klimstra, Bart Duriez, Stijn Van Petegem and Wim Beyers. "Personal Identity Processes from Adolescence Through the Late 20s: Age Trends, Functionality, and Depressive Symptoms," *Social Development*. Volume 22, Issue 4. November 2013, http:// onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/sode.12027/abstract, p. 716.
- <sup>83</sup> Carnevale, Smith, Melton, and Price, p. 11.
- <sup>84</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 13.
- <sup>85</sup> US Chamber of Commerce Foundation. "Scaling Youth Employment Through Business-Facing Intermediaries," US Chamber of Commerce Foundation: Center for Education and Workforce. https://www.uschamberfoundation.org/sites/default/files/Talent%20Orchestrators%20 Scaling%20Youth%20Employment%20Through%20Business%20Facing%20Intermediaries.pdf, 2016, p. 17.
- <sup>86</sup> 60 percent of Black/African-American, 52 percent of Hispanic/Latinos, 48 percent of Asians and 35 percent of white teens report desiring to work but being unable to find work or unable to transition from part to full time employment. Hoffman, N. "Let's Get Real: Deeper Learning and the Power of the Workplace (Rep.)," http://www.jff.org/sites/default/files/publications/materials/ Lets-Get-Real-021715.pdf, Jobs for the Future, 2015, p. 5., citing: Sum, A. et al. "The Plummeting Labor Market Fortunes of Teens and Young Adults," Washington D.C.: Metropolitan Policy Program & The Brookings Institution, 2014.
- <sup>87</sup> 27 percent of teen workers work in a low wage industry such as food and personal services, compared to only 15 percent in 1980. Hoffman, p. 5., citing: Anthony P. Carnevale, Andrew R. Hanson and Artem Gulish. "Failure to Launch: Structural Shift and the New Lost Generation," Washington D. C.: Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce, 2013.
- <sup>88</sup> Hoffman, p. 17.
- <sup>89</sup> Michelsen and Sriraman, p. 321.
- <sup>90</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 237.



<sup>91</sup> Donachie.

<sup>92</sup> Hoffman, p 2.

- <sup>93</sup> SRI International. "Taking Stock of the California Linked Learning District Initiative," prepared for the James Irvine Foundation. December 2015, pp. vi-ix.
- <sup>94</sup> Hanushek, Eric A., Guido Schwerdt, Ludger Woessmann and Lei Zhang, "General Education, Vocational Education, and Labor-Market Outcomes over the Lifecycle", The Journal of Human Resources, Winter 2017 vol. 52, no 1. Pp. 48-87.
- <sup>95</sup> Barnum, Matt. "The Downside to Career and Technical Education", *The Atlantic*. 6 June 2017. https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2017/06/the-downside-to-career-and-technical-education/529161/,
- <sup>96</sup> Michelsen and Sriraman, p. 323.
- <sup>97</sup> Pellegrino, James W., and Margaret L. Hilton, *Education for Life and Work: Developing Transferable Knowledge and Skills in the 21st Century*, National Research Council of the National Academies. National Academies Press. Washington, D.C.: 2012, p. 113.
- <sup>98</sup> Paul, Annie Murphy. "Are College Lectures Unfair?," *The New York Times*, http://nyti. ms/1UOpKJg, Sept. 12, 2015.
- <sup>99</sup> Wlodkowski and Ginsburg, pp. 17-21.
- <sup>100</sup> A simple Google search for "importance of active learning" returned 6.3 million hits.
- <sup>101</sup> Honey, Margaret, Greg Pearson, and Heidi Schweingruber, "STEM Integration in K-12 Education: Status, Prospects, and an Agenda for Research," Committee on Integrated STEM Education, National Academy of Engineering, National Research Council, 2014, p. 64.
- <sup>102</sup> Carnevale, Smith, Melton, and Price, p. 18.
- <sup>103</sup> Honey, Pearson, and Schweingruber, p. 64.
- <sup>104</sup> Pellegrino and Hilton. p. 6.
- <sup>105</sup> Gottfried, p. 3.
- <sup>106</sup> Change the Equation and AMGEN Foundation, "Students on STEM: More Hands-On, Real-World Experiences", http://changetheequation.org/sites/default/files/CTEq%20Amgen%20Brief\_FINAL. pdf, June 2016, p. 3.
- <sup>107</sup> White, Martha C., "The Real Reason New College Grads Can't Get Hired," Time. http://business. time.com/2013/11/10/the-real-reason-new-college-grads-cant-get-hired/, 13 November 2013.
- <sup>108</sup> Pellegrino and Hilton, pp. 70, 84.
- <sup>109</sup> Digital Promise. "Developing a System of Micro-Credentials: Supporting Deeper Learning in the Classroom."
- <sup>110</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 1-5.
- <sup>111</sup> Crone, Ian and Kathy MacKay, "Motivating Today's College Students", *peerReview*, Association of American Colleges & Universities, Winter 2007, Vol. 9, No. 1.
- <sup>112</sup> Pellegrino and Hilton, Editors, p. 169.
- <sup>113</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 9.
- <sup>114</sup> Hoffman, p. 17.
- <sup>115</sup> Pellegrino and Hilton, p. 162.
- <sup>116</sup> *Ibid.* p. 164.



<sup>117</sup> Kubasik, Jane and Clare Keller. "Professional Pathway Readiness for Today's Students Preparing our nation's learners for the changing workplace," White Paper, 114<sup>th</sup> Partnership, 2016, p. 6. Referencing: Barry, B., and Yadav, A., "The case method: Using case based instruction to increase ethical understanding in engineering courses," Washington, DC: *American Society for Engineering Education*, 2007. Also: Kim, S., Phillips, W. R., Pinsky, L., Brock, D., Phillips, K., & Keary, J. "A conceptual framework for developing teaching cases: A review and synthesis of the literature across disciplines," *Medical Education*, 40(9), 2006, pp. 867-876. And: Lundeberg, M., Mogen, K., Bergland, M., & Klyczek, K. "Case it or else!" *Journal of College Science Teaching*, 32(1), 2002, p. 64. And: Mong, C. J., & Ertmer, P. A. "Addressing STEM education needs: The case for adopting a PBL approach," *Educational Technology*, 53(3), 2013, 12-21. And: Yadav, A., Lundeberg, M., DeSchryver, M., & Dirkin, K. "Teaching science with case studies: A national survey of faculty perceptions of the benefits and challenges of using cases," *Journal of College Science Teaching*, 35(6), 2006, pp. 8-13.

<sup>118</sup> Wlodkowski and Ginsburg, pp. 17-21.

- <sup>119</sup> American Institutes for Research. "Does Deeper Learning Improve Student Outcomes?" http:// www.air.org/sites/default/files/Deeper-Learning-Summary-Updated-August-2016.pdf. August 2016, p. 2.
- <sup>120</sup> Kemple, James J. and Jason C. Snipes. "Career Academies: Impacts on Students' Engagement and Performance in High School," March 2000, p. 2.
- <sup>121</sup> American Institutes for Research, p. 3.
- <sup>122</sup> Unfortunately, too many of today's CTE programs do not meet these criteria. See: Hoffman, p 2.
- <sup>123</sup> For a discussion the resource and time impact to school districts of coordinating external internships, See: Hoffman, p. 17.
- <sup>124</sup> For information on the number of enrolled students, see: National Center for Education Statistics. Table 105.20. "Enrollment in elementary, secondary, and degree-granting postsecondary institutions, by level and control of institution, enrollment level, and attendance status and sex of student: Selected years, fall 1990 through fall 2025." *Digest of Education Statistics*. U.S. Department of Education. Washington, D.C.. https://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d15/tables/ dt15\_105.20.asp?current=yes.
- <sup>125</sup> Change the Equation and AMGEN Foundation, "Students on STEM: More Hands-On, Real-World Experiences", http://changetheequation.org/sites/default/files/CTEq%20Amgen%20Brief\_FINAL. pdf, June 2016, p. 3.
- 126 Hart, p. 6.
- <sup>127</sup> Musto, Pete. "US College Students Feel Unprepared for 'Real' World", VOA, 6 October 2016, https://www.voanews.com/a/us-college-students-feel-unprepared-for-real-world/3539712.html.
- <sup>128</sup> Richard Elmore. "Improving the Instructional Core," *School of Education*, Harvard University, 2014, https://sd48seatosky.files.wordpress.com/2014/03/changing-the-instructional-core-elmore.pdf.
- <sup>129</sup> Carnevale, A. P., Hanson, A. R., & Gulish, A. "Failure to Launch: Structural Shift to the New Lost Generation (Rep.).," https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/FTL\_FullReport. pdf, September 2013, p. 25.
- <sup>130</sup> Visher, Mary G, Jacklyn N. Altuna, Stephanie Safran. "Making it Happen: How Career Academics Can Build College and Career Exploration Programs," January 2013, pp. ES 11-13.
- <sup>131</sup> Time limitation also plays a significant factor. See, for example: Herreid, C. F., & Schiller, N. A. "Case studies and the flipped classroom," *Journal of College Science Teaching*, 42(5), 2013, pp. 62-66. Quoted in Kubasik and Keller, p. 5.
- <sup>132</sup> Hoffman, p. 17.
- <sup>133</sup> Data reported by teachers to the US Department of Education, National Assessment of Educational Progress, 2015 Science Assessment. Quoted in: *Change the Equation Newsletter*, 28 October 2016. http://changetheequation.org/blog/archive/201610.



<sup>134</sup> Moyer, Jessie. "The Role of Partnerships in Personalized Learning". KnowledgeWorks. http:// knowledgeworks.org/worldoflearning/2017/01/partnerships-personalized-learning/?mkt\_tok=ey-JpljoiWVdGa05qRmhPRGsxWldKailsInQiOiJTeTFvdVlwZndRakFYWCtCMlZYcGtqTGJWejZKbV ZSVCtpblVIY0N4cHFkNUtCQWd6elRzb09xUnlsSU9HNFwvRINDdzQ4N2FjcnB6VWpQNEFaUz-RIN294QThDUTFkUURIQIRSMFN6K1dVMG9USkRTN2hNM3pOZ3pzTTEwbGdOVIlifQ%3D%3D, 9 January 2017.

<sup>135</sup> Change the Equation and the AMGEN Foundation, p. 3.

- <sup>136</sup> Jan W. Rivkin et al. "Partial Credit: How America's School Superintendents See Business as a Partner," Harvard Business School, Feb. 2014, p. 11.
- <sup>137</sup> Camiller, Mark Anthony. "Re-conceiving Corporate Social Responsibility Programmes for Education," http://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-35083-7\_9, August 3, 2016, p. 167.
- <sup>138</sup> Allan, Sara, Allen Grossman, Jan W. Rivkin and Nithya Vaduganathan, "Lasting Impact: A Business Leader's Playbook for Supporting America's Schools," Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, The Boston Consulting Group and Harvard Business School, p. 3.

<sup>139</sup> Rivkin, p. 12.

- <sup>140</sup> Grossman, Allen S. and Ann B. Lombard, "Business Aligning for Students: The Promise of Collective Impact", Harvard Business School, pp. 1-36.
- <sup>141</sup> Allen S. Grossman and Geoff Marietta. "Montgomery County Business Roundtable for Education". Harvard Business School. Case 9-309-105. 7 May 2009. Pages 1-3.
- <sup>142</sup> Corporate Voices for Working Families. "Business and Community College Partnerships: A Blueprint", http://www.iwnc.org/documents/LearnEarnBlueprint.pdf, Industry Workforce Needs Coalition, p. 8.

<sup>143</sup> Hoffman, p. 14.

- <sup>144</sup> This summary pulls from: Kubasik, Jane and Clare Keller. "Professional Pathway Readiness for Today's Students Preparing our nation's learners for the changing workplace," White Paper, 114th Partnership, 2016, p. 10.
- <sup>145</sup> Hussar, William J. and Tabitha M. Bailey. "Projection of Education Statistics to 2022." National Center for Education Statistics, https://nces.ed.gov/pubs2014/2014051.pdf, p. 47. See also: National Center for Education Statistics. "Fast Facts: What are the new back to school statistics for 2016?" http://nces.ed.gov/fastfacts/display.asp?id=372, Washington, DC, 2016.

### The 114th Partnership®

Named for the meridian that bridges the Great Continental Divide, the 114th Partnership is a national nonprofit that equips young people to navigate education and career pathways.

We are well on our way to enlisting 500 employers and 30,000 educators to inspire at least 1,000,000 secondary students to acquire the skills to pursue personally meaningful, high-opportunity careers. For more information on how you can help motivate students to pursue high-skills, highopportunity careers, please email professionalpathways@114th.org.

### www.114th.org

